

Dilemmatic of Muhammadiyah Orphanage as Faith Based Organization in Malang, Indonesia

¹Fauzik Lendriyono and ²Soni A. Nulhaqim

¹University of Muhammadiyah Malang, Malang, Indonesia

²University of Padjadjaran Bandung, Bandung, Indonesia

Abstract: Muhammadiyah is an organization that is based on Islamic values. This study aims to evaluate the dilemmas of the Muhammadiyah Orphanage in Malang, Indonesia, using a phenomenological study approach. The subject is people who are directly involved in the orphanage management from nine orphanages as representative of the organization. Data were obtained through observation, in-depth interviews and a review of documentation from the orphanage in Malang. The results stated that the Muhammadiyah is social organizations based on the Islamic religion and is a modern religious organization in Indonesia. Muhammadiyah greatly contributes to the development in Indonesia through three social missions known as the Muhammadiyah charity effort. Those are education service, health service and social service. From the results the existence of three dilemmas were identified that are a continual problem for Muhammadiyah orphanages, namely resources, process and outcome. However, these do not hamper their activities, in fact, their existence is increasingly influential in efforts to improve the quality of services.

Key words: Muhammadiyah, dilemma, orphanage Islamic, depth, Indonesia

INTRODUCTION

A study on Faith-Based Organizations (FBO) indicates that they place a strong emphasis on spiritual activities, beliefs and rituals and emphasize the importance of structure and discipline (Neff *et al.*, 2006). The FBO is more important than secular organizations because society needs it (Reingold *et al.*, 2007). Nevertheless, FBOs are deemed to be lacking in management because they are more oriented towards non-material things rather than material (Neff *et al.*, 2006). In addition, the effectiveness of the services provided by FBOs are seen to be worse than that of secular organizations (Miller, 2015; Reingold *et al.*, 2007). But yet, Dinham and Shaw (2011) noticed that this effectiveness really depends on how the researchers measured the impact of FBOs. If viewed materially, it may be true that the FBO perform poorly but when viewed spiritually their results can be seen as better than those of secular organizations.

Muhammadiyah is a community organization that is based on Islamic religious values. These religious reasons place Muhammadiyah in the classification of Faith-Based Organization (FBO), an organization that cares and provides social services motivated by religious teachings. In Muhammadiyah, this motivation is based on the assumption that the religion in which they believe is the way to solve social problems. Therefore, in its social

mission, Muhammadiyah established educational institutions, healthcare institutions and social service institutions. These three institutions established by Muhammadiyah are known collectively as the Muhammadiyah charity effort. One element/part of the social service institution is its orphanages.

The orphanages were established to provide services and to orphans, abandoned children and to children from poor families. Religious values are embedded in the establishment and management are QS. Al Maa'uun: 1-7; Ad Dhuha: 1-11; Al Fajr: 17-18; Al Baqoroh: 83, 177, 215, 220; An Nisaa: 127; Al An'am: 152-153; Al Insan: 8-22. Because of this social mission, the orphanage could be referred to as a Human Service Organization (HSO). The Muhammadiyah Orphanage can be described as an HSO that encompasses the missions of FBO. In its organizational structure, the orphanage is under the coordination and control of the Muhammadiyah as a parent organization. Research on the orphanage dilemmatic in the Muhammadiyah is something new. This study focuses on evaluating the Muhammadiyah orphanage dilemmatic which are faith-based organizations.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

This study uses a phenomenological approach to identify the essence of the experience of the subject of a

particular phenomenon and to understand the life experiences of the subjects; this approach is used to assess a number of subjects that are directly involved over a relatively long period' (Creswell *et al.*, 2007). Data collection techniques include observation, interviews (including the results of discussions) and assessment of documents. Observations were conducted to obtain an overview of the orphanage existence which includes area and location description, social condition, politics and society religiousness, resources and orphanage condition. Interviews were conducted with the selected people as research subjects. The assessment of documentation data included manuscripts, important notes, activity reports and other secondary data relevant to this study.

Research subjects were determined by consideration of the following main characteristics: the subject knows the cultural area well and has witnessed events in the research area; the subject is deeply involved in activities within the research area; the subject is a person who is quite aware of the situation in the research area with no pretensions to analyze an event; on field research, researchers may spend a long time with the community (Neuman, 1991). Based on these characteristics eight subjects were selected, comprising the Branch Chairman of the Muhammadiyah Aisyiyah, member of the orphanage management and the founding figures of the Muhammadiyah Orphanage. Data analysis techniques were began with data reduction folowed by the presentation and conclusion (Neuman, 1991). The stages of this data analysis are based on Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA) as stated by Smith *et al.* (2009). Six steps are involved in data analysis using IPA) reading and re-reading, in order to understand the data by reading the transcript or the findings of the initial data repeatedly) discussing the semantic content and the use of language at a very exploratory level. Analysts maintain an open mind and note the interesting things in the transcript. Supporting activities were a descriptive comment, linguistic comment, conceptual deconstruction of comment and an overview of initial written notes performing the coding and taxonomy construction searching links to the emerged themes discussing on the next theme/case and looking for patterns in the analyzed cases. To support the validity of the data, the standard validity of the study as proposed by Bryman which meet the following four requirements were used credibility transferability dependability and confirmability.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Muhammadiyah orphanages in Malangi: In Malangi, there are 12 Muhammadiyah orphanages which are divided into

Muhammadiyah orphanages for boys and Aisyiyah orphanages for girls. Both types of orphanage have the same role and function. A number of these orphanages accommodate ± 300 foster children. They are orphans, abandoned children and children from poor families/dhuafa. The Muhammadiyah Orphanages were initiated, established, managed and developed voluntarily by citizens of the Muhammadiyah. Therefore, the Muhammadiyah Orphanages have unique characteristics that differ from the other orphanages. These differences are in resources, processes and outcomes. Resource differences lie in the ability to acquire funds for the orphanage operation. The process differences lie in the form of services, education and guidance on child custody while the outcome differences lie in the output which is generated after the completion of foster children's time in the orphanage. But the spirit that all these orphanages are built on is the same, namely the implementation of QS. Al Maa'uun 1-7. This spirit is what makes the Muhammadiyah today as the Islamic religious organization with the largest number of orphanages in Indonesia.

From the perspective of culture, the Muhammadiyah Orphanage is considered as a "sacred place" by some people through which they can achieve their goals or expectations. People from various circles/institutions provide assistance or donations to the orphanage with the hope of receiving the blessing of Allah because they have helped orphans, abandoned children and children from poor families. They also believe that by his actions, prayers and wishes can be granted by Allah Almighty so that their hopes can be achieved. Such belief is very deeply entrenched in society. The presumption of the orphanage as a "sacred place" has created a dilemma. The orphanage management does not need to try very hard to get funding from the community. On the other hand, they are required to guarantee to provide services that will fulfill the rights of the children and meet the organization's goals.

Dilemmatic of the Muhammadiyah orphanage: The results showed that the management of the orphanage faces three serious dilemmas. These three dilemmas are the economical dilemma regarding resources, the control dilemma on the process and the goals' dilemma regarding the outcome. These dilemmas occur throughout the organization as a system and arise because of the tension between the orphanage management and the Muhammadiyah management itself. These two managements have different perspectives. The Muhammadiyah Orphanage in terms of its organizational structure as a social organization is part of the Muhammadiyah as the parent organization. So, this

orphanage is under the supervision and guidance of the Muhammadiyah. The resources dilemma arises from the question of whether the Muhammadiyah orphanage is a social organization or a charity effort. The processes dilemma arises with the question of whether the Muhammadiyah orphanage operates according to the wishes of Muhammadiyah or the desires of the orphanage management. Whereas the outcome dilemma arises with the question of whether the Muhammadiyah orphanage aims to produce a cadre of Muhammadiyah or foster children whose excellent and potentially optimal. Discussions about these three dilemma are described as follows:

Resources dilemma: Finance is one of the resources for the orphanage and the Muhammadiyah. As an institution that literally is a social institution, naturally the public perceives that the orphanage relies on donations from the community. But this is difficult to achieve if the communities themselves cannot afford to contribute and is also difficult to achieve if Muhammadiyah does not contribute funds to the orphanage. Therefore, the orphanages take various measures to meet their financial needs. It is actually not a problem if the orphanages stand alone. The government itself has also stated that a good orphanage should be independent. But the problem arises when the orphanages turn into a sort of charity effort which makes it financially impossible to provide input to the Muhammadiyah.

On the other hand, the orphanage as a form of social charity means that the orphanage depends on the financial resources that are not forthcoming from donors. This is why a number of orphanages put a donation box at the mall or in public places for fundraising. Sources of orphanage funds, like Muhammadiyah globally, come from donations (members, community and government) and the results of its productive economic activities. As far as all of these funds are managed by the orphanage themselves without having to give any to the Muhammadiyah, then the orphanage can be seen as a nonprofit institution. A nonprofit institution is one that is capable of generating a financial surplus but does not hand this over to the owner (Smillie, 1995). Meanwhile, the orphanage is an institution owned by Muhammadiyah. Therefore, when the orphanage gives up some funds to the Muhammadiyah, the orphanage can be categorized as a for profit institution, although the delivery of funds is incidental and not all orphanages contribute.

When a nonprofit institution slowly changes its orientation to a for-profit institution, a paradoxical concept appears: a charity market where donors might contribute with various promises, including the promise

to return again to contribute more generously. The orphanage position as a for-profit institution is actually justified solely by its position as a charity effort. In fact, one of the functions of charity efforts is to develop resources for the success of the mission of Muhammadiyah Da'wah.

Processes dilemma: Orphanage activity is highly dependent on many factors rather than solely financial resources. The financial resources factor is indeed determined by many things but management competency, caregiver's competency, foster-care characteristics, society's socioeconomic situation and others are also very important factors in an orphanage. From all of these factors, the main guidelines are policies and programs for activities. But the question of who is actually the most decisive in policies and programs becomes a new dilemma. If the orphanage is part of the Muhammadiyah, then ideally it would obey all the commands of the Muhammadiyah as the parent, entirely abiding with its decisions.

In order to realize the policies and orphanage programs, managerial resources that are competent in their fields are required. Dreyfus and Dreyfus provided a review of how competency became a strong capital for organizations and considered that there are five stages of proficiency: beginner, experienced, beginner practitioner, knowledgeable practitioner, and expert. The beginner blindly follows all orders from superiors while the experienced beginner starts to take into account the situation in executing the command. Practitioners have long-term goals and plans that are in line with the outline of the superiors while knowledgeable practitioners have personal long-term goals and plans which take into account the background aspects in addition to the aspects of the superiors' outline. The expert has an intuitive nature by focusing directly on the central aspects of the superiors' wishes. The fifth stage of proficiency in the above still falls within the scope of the organization and is guided by the rules (Rule Driven Organization-RDO). Besides RDO, there is also an MDO (Mission Driven Organization), an organization that is guided by a mission that is made entirely based on context. An orphanage as an RDO means the main orientation is on the rules made by the organization (Muhammadiyah) at the level of central, regional, branch or twig. Of course, the powers of each level of the hierarchy have been set up and these conditions provide little freedom for the orphanages to regulate themselves, especially in efforts to face the rapidly changing situation in their surrounding environment. If the hierarchy of the authorities do not carry out their duties, the RDO will seek

guidance from the higher hierarchy because they are concerned about breaking the rules if they make decisions for themselves. On the contrary, the MDO will make its own rules because the hierarchy that authorizes it does not fulfill its obligation to provide guidance. In this context, the operationalization of the orphanage turns to face the problems that lead to internal conflict in the management of the orphanage as well as in the management of the Muhammadiyah itself.

Outcome dilemma: The next dilemma lies in the outcome, the results of the parenting and fostering that have been conducted by the orphanage. Whether the orientation of the orphanage is toward the cadre depends on whether the cadre is included in the category of absolute, moderate or weak. These results are associated with the methods of management, coaching and services that exist within the orphanage. If the orphanage must absolutely produce cadres, then the applied method is the version of the panopticon which controls the entire lifetime of protégés such as through the pesantren method or rigorous internal education. The moderate cadre provides a wider space where children are free to go outside the orphanage but at certain times, for example by being placed in Muhammadiyah schools. Meanwhile, the weak cadre sees the child only positioned as a client with the less powerful doctrine of Muhammadiyah.

The analysis of this study explained that the Muhammadiyah orphanages are very varied. If viewed from the aspect of education in terms of the cadre mission, then there are two orphanages in the less powerful category because they allow the foster children to attend school anywhere in accordance with their interests and do not make them attend the Muhammadiyah school. Both orphanages were initialized as the Da1 Orphanage and the Law Orphanage. Meanwhile, there are two orphanages in the moderate category because they determine school choice at the elementary and junior high school level at Muhammadiyah schools but liberate school choice at the high school level. Both orphanages were initialized as the Bat Orphanage and Din Orphanage. Orphanages with a strong category in education were initialized as the MM Orphanage, Sin Orphanage and the Bar Orphanage. These three orphanages are closer to a panopticon (Foucault, 1995), obliging all foster children to attend Muhammadiyah school from elementary level until high school level. While the other orphanage that is considered the strongest in the education of cadres was initialized as the Gdl Orphanage. At this orphanage, the management has made the orphanage like a pesantren and it has effectively become a panopticon to produce cadres of the organization.

Viewed from the productivity aspect, the Muhammadiyah orphanage has a different variety of productive activities. Productivity orientation is economic productivity which is measured by the ability of the orphanage management to create and acquire the orphanage operation costs not only from public donations or government but from the business sector as well. In this object study, the orphanages are categorized into three main groups: productive, semi-productive and not yet productive. The productive orphanage is considered quite capable of performing economic activity and the results can be used to finance operations such as the Bar, the MM and the Din orphanages. The semi-productive orphanage that has productive assets but is not run by its management instead of external parties that provide half of the profit to them such as the Gdl Sin and Bat orphanages. Whereas the not yet productive orphanage is the one that seeks to be productive but is not yet supported by sufficient assets. Therefore, its operational costs are more expected to come from community contributions; as the Law, Da1 and Da2 Orphanage are examples of the not yet productive orphanage.

Analysis of the concept of faith-based organization: An orphanage is a Human Service Organization (HSO). Meanwhile a Muhammadiyah orphanage is an HSO in a Faith-Based Organization (FBO). An FBO is an organization with a specific orientation. A large number of studies have been conducted on these organizational models (Branch, 2002; Casselman *et al.*, 2015; Wuthnow *et al.*, 2004) and the researchers explained that the FBO has an impact not only on the client but also on management and society. In the Muhammadiyah orphanages, the impact on the management occurs through personal changes, their profession and spiritual life. For the client, changes to certain aspects are present, depending on the purpose of the program such as lifestyle, behavior or attitude. For the community, the change that occurs is marked by the emergence of symptoms of voluntarism in which members of society become involved in assisting in the institution even without being paid (Ferguson *et al.*, 2007).

The Muhammadiyah orphanage in the concept of an FBO is a cross between a purely religious institution and a purely secular institution. As a purely religious organization, the Muhammadiyah orphanage is an institution that provides services and benefits to orphans, abandoned children and poor families as the manifestation of religious values in the QS Al Maa'uun. Meanwhile as a purely secular institution, the Muhammadiyah orphanage makes productive economic efforts which are

oriented on material profit. Although, profits earned are used for the operation of the orphanage, this context of economic efforts for material profit is a characteristic of purely secular institutions. The more an FBO imitates the pattern of modern organizations (secularized), the more difficult it is to maintain and protect its religious identity. Modern organizations are characterized by a form of hierarchy and bureaucracy, whereas an FBO is characterized by a high religious aspect which should be non-hierarchical and non-bureaucratic (Bielefeld and Cleveland, 2013; Vanderwoerd, 2004).

CONCLUSION

It should be recognized that the Muhammadiyah orphanage is in a dilemmatic position which has the potential to allow the emergence of inconsistencies in the Muhammadiyah movement. As an example, the orphanage is a charity effort institution for the Muhammadiyah. However, the orphanage is also supposed to be a social charity for the Muhammadiyah that should orient its actions only to social services as the implementation of religious teachings; on the other hand, it is required to have a productive economic unit that can support not only the orphanage but also the parent organization.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The researcher thanks Padjajaran University and the University of Muhammadiyah Malang for supporting this research.

REFERENCES

- Bielefeld, W. and W.S. Cleveland, 2013. Defining faith-based organizations and understanding them through research. *Nonprofit Voluntary Sector Q.*, Vol. 2013, 10.1177/0899764013484090
- Branch, A.Y., 2002. Faith and Action: Implementation of the National Faith-Based Initiative for High Risk Youth. Public-Private Ventures, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.
- Casselmann, R.M., L.M. Sama and A. Stefanidis, 2015. Differential social performance of religiously-affiliated microfinance institutions (MFIs) in Base of Pyramid (BoP) markets. *J. Bus. Ethics*, 132: 539-552.
- Creswell, J. W. and V.L. Plano Clark, 2007. *Designing and Conducting Mixed Methods Research*. Sage Publications, Thousand Oaks, CA., USA.
- Dinham, A. and M. Shaw, 2011. Measurement as reflection in faith-based social action. *Community Dev. J.*, 2011: 126-141.
- Ferguson, K.M., Q. Wu, M.D. Spruijt and G. Dyrness, 2007. Outcomes evaluation in faith-based social services: Are we evaluating faith accurately?. *Res. Soc. Work Pract.*, 17: 264-276.
- Foucault, M., 1995. *Discipline and Punishment: The Birth of The Prison*. Vintage Books, New York.
- Miller, S.A.D., 2015. Faith Based Organizations and International Responses to Forced Migration. In: *The Changing World Religion Map*, Stanley, D.B. (Ed.). Springer, Netherlands, Europe, ISBN:978-94-017-9375-9, pp: 3115-3133.
- Neff, J.A., C.T. Shorkey and L.C. Windsor, 2006. Contrasting faith-based and traditional substance abuse treatment programs. *J. Substance Abuse Treat.*, 30: 49-61.
- Neuman, W.L., 1991. *Social Research Methods: Quantitative and Qualitative Approaches*. 2nd Edn., Allyn and Bacon, Boston, London.
- Reingold, D.A., M. Pirog and D. Brady, 2007. *Empirical Evidence on Faith-Based Organization in Era of Welfare Reform*. The University of Chicago, Chicago, Illinois.
- Smillie, I., 1995. *The Alms Bazaar: Altruism Under Fire*. Non-Profit Organizations and International Development. International Development Research Centre, Ottawa, Canada, ISBN:9780889367814, Pages: 286.
- Smith, J.A., P. Flowers and M. Larkin, 2009. *Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis: Theory, Method and Research*. SAGE Publications, London, UK.
- Vanderwoerd, J.R., 2004. How faith-based social service organizations manage secular pressures associated with government funding. *Nonprofit Manage. Leadership*, 14: 239-262.
- Wuthnow, R., C. Hackett and B.Y. Hsu, 2004. The effectiveness and trustworthiness of faith-based and other service organizations: A study of recipients' perceptions. *J. Sci. Study Religion*, 43: 1-17.