Translation in Polyphonic Narrations: Bakhtin's Polyphony in Alice Munro's the Love of a Good Woman

¹Azadeh Moghimi Dehkordi and ²Vida Rahiminezhad
¹Department of English, Faculty of Foreign Languages,
Islamic Azad University, South Tehran Branch, Tehran, Iran
²Research Institute for Education, Organization for Educational Research and Planning,
Iranian Association for Sociology of Education, Tehran, Iran

Abstract: The present study carries out a research on the voices existed in the original polyphonic stories to see that how they are translated in the Persian translations as the target language. Mikhail Bakhtin, as a Russian literary theorist introduces his theory on the voices, stating that there are multiple voices in the stories which are belonged to the author, narrator and characters. In order to show the many voices, one of the method using by the authors is a technique of Free Indirect Discourse (FID) as a mode of narration. FID is composed of some linguistic devices in the story for demonstrating multiple voices. This study investigate voices in the Persian translations of three short stories of The Love of a Good Woman collection written by Alice Munro since she uses FID markers as a result the nature of her present short stories are polyphonic. The researcher found some samples of FID markers in the source text and then compared them with their persian translation. Findings reveal that in the translation of these short stories although, the translator seems to have been partially aware of the FID used in the STs and although she has made an attempt to reproduce them in the TTs, the partial failure in reflecting the voices in the Sts as well as in back-shifting the tenses have damaged the polyphonic nature of the STs.

Key words: Direct discourse, indirect discourse, free indirect discourse, Persian translation, polyphony

INTRODUCTION

Dostoevsky's crime and punishment is the start point for a Russian linguist, thinker, philosopher and literary theorist, Bakhtin (1981) to present his theory on polyphonic novels. According to him, Dostoevsky is a creator of polyphonic novel in which many voices can be heard. Theses voices are belonged to the author, narrator and characters. As their voices are merged together, no voice subordinates to other voices and their thoughts, ideologies and point of view are expressed freely. Thus bakhtin calls this kinds of many voicedness novel as polyphonic ones. With this regard Baldick (1990) states that a polyphonic novel is "one in which several different voices or points of view interacts on more or less equal terms". So it is said that the polyphonic novel consist of the plurality of individual voices belonging to) the author's own voice, the author's voice is the one among the many voices in the novel) the narrator's voice and) the voice of various characters". In the field of translation,

transferring multiple voices from original text into target text is a problematic issues because a translator sometimes fails to render the linguistic devices used for polyphonic novel therefore the many voices are tended to one voice.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

The present study relies on Munday's conception of style, McArthur's (FID) and contrastive analysis of the source and target texts to critique the translation. For this purpose three short stories from Munro's collection with the title of "The Love of a Good Woman" are chosen. Munro (1998) is a first Canadian author of Nobel Prize winner for literature in 2013, the master of the writing short story. Munro's short stories and collections show the expression of thoughts and feelings. She introduces multi different world which is illustrated by unmerged characters and narrator's voices. The protagonists played a role in her short stories are women. The women who are influenced on their deep-rooted custom and tradition

Corresponding Author: Azadeh Moghimi Dehkordi, Department of English, Faculty of Foreign Languages,
Islamic Azad University, South Tehran Branch, Tehran, Iran

involve with love. The existence or the lack of love is the main subject matter that Munro shows it in all of her short stories. The Love of a Good Woman was awarded both Giller Prize and National Book Critics Circle Award for fiction in 1998 as well as it was the selected books in the 2004 edition of Canada Reads. The present study focuses on three short stories of this collection with the titles of "The Love of a Good Woman", "Cortes Island" and "My Mother's Dream" since these three short stories have been translated in Persian language by Shaghayegh Ghandhary. Ghandhary is one of the Persian translator who lives in Iran, Tehran. She has translated more than fifty books and received several literary awards for her translation. She also plans to research and writing children's literature and criticism in specialized publications on its own.

As it is mentioned earlier, the researcher uses Munday's strategies for investigating the voices existing in fictions. According to him "Bakhtin (1984)'s view of narrative as polyphonic removes the absolute boundaries between both source and target and between the intra-and extralinguistic features of the text". Studying on the voices in the translated texts, Munday uses Bakhtin's idea based on that there is a relationship between "voice, style and discourse in the dialogic intermeshing of characters, groups and points of view" (Munday, 2008). Thus, he claims that the first thing to consider the voices in ST is the style but in order to investigate the style, the text should be taken into account in terms of linguistic. He express that a text "is the only immediately visible part of the narrative, it is only by studying the language of the text that the style of the author or translator might really be identified and hence the voice (s) present in the discourse be determined. Voice is therefore to be approached through the analysis of style". Following Munday's advice as to the importance of a stylistic analysis of the source texts (hereafter STs), it is shown that the polyphonous nature of these short stories are to a great extent due to the deployment of FID as the mode of narration. FID is a technique used in polyphonic fictions. In this field, there are many discussions expressed by some scholars like Fludernik, Page, Pascal (1977), Banfield, McHal, Rimmon-Kenan and Ehrlich. However, there were some defects and shortcomings in their statements so the present researcher decides to choose McArthur' model on FID.

McArthur (1998), introduces four types of discourse in narration: Direct Discourse (DD), Indirect Discourse (ID), Free Direct Discourse (FDD) and Free Indirect Discourse (FID). FID as a major tool in this research is a technique used by writers in order to show the narrator

and the character's voice. FID regards both speech and thought and consists of a mixed linguistically features of DD and ID. DD is a character' word/thought which is told by the narrator with the exact words of that charters. The features of DD is the introductory verbs such as 'say' or 'claim' and etc., quotation mark, first or second person pronoun, the verbs which is belonged in almost the time to present time, the near locatives and temporals such as 'here' and 'now' and at last the subjective and emotive expressions. ID is a narrator's words retelling the character's words/thought by his/her own words. It means that if the narrator wants to change the DD-ID, he removes the quotation mark, adds the conjunction such as 'that', back shifts the present verbs to the past, adjusts the pronouns, changes the near locatives and temporals to his own words and omits the punctuation marks such as question marks or exclamation marks that the character uses of that markers in order to show his/her feelings in DD. However when FID appears within the text, it takes some features of DD and ID. DD features is the near locatives and temporals and subjective and emotive expressions, while there is no introductory verb. ID features is the adjusted of pronoun and the back shifted of tenses. This combination of some features of DD as a character's voice and ID as a narrative voice leads to create a combined discourse or what Pascal (1977) termed the dual voice. He states that by merging the author, characters and narrator's voice, subjectivity and objectivity in FID provide 'dual voice' and there for the polyphony has been created.

With a comparison between the STs and the TTs, the researcher is going to show how voices are heard in the three Persian translations of Munro's short stories collection.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

By comparing STs and TTs, the followings are some samples from three selected of Munro's short stories containing FID markers. They are extracted from the original text and compared the target text then investigate them how they are translated. The first sample belongs to the The Love of a Good Woman (TLGW) in which the dual voices can be heard: If she were a Catholic, she thought, was this the sort of thing that could come out at confession?. According to the sample, there are not introductory verb and quotation mark but some features of ID and DD, giving rise to create FID. The back shifted of verbs such as 'were', 'was' and 'thought' and the adjusted pronoun such as 'she' show the signs of ID. The near locative of 'this' and the modal auxiliary 'could' indicate DD. Modals show the voice of the character

since some sort of personal attitude toward the event is evoked by the use of modals and this subjectivity is what an objective third person narrator is not expected to have (Verdonk, 2002). The question mark is also another indicators of FID markers putted in the punctuation part. The existence of this type of punctuation is also an evident for this claim that "narrators do not exclaim, characters do" (Hoff, 2009). All of these characteristics leads to hearing two voices; the character and that the narrator's. However in the Persian translation, the back shifted of verb 'were' has been translated to 'hastam', i.e., (am) in ST. Moreover the third person 'she' as an indicator of ID is rendered as 'man', i.e. (I) in ST and the modal auxiliary 'could' is rendered as 'mitavânam', i.e., (to be able) in ST. The whole of the sentence has been translated in a way that it seems to be a DD not FID and therefor the duality of voices has been blurred.

The second example again is related to the TLGW: And here she was, here was Enid, working her life away pretending it wasn't so (TLGW). There are again some ID and DD features which are blended together to provide two voices, the narrator and the character. The back shifted of verbs such as 'was' and 'was not' and the adjusted pronoun 'she' show ID as a narrator's voice. The near locative 'here' used in that sentences indicates character's voice. All of them give rise FID. Like the previous case, no introductory verb and quotation marks are existent. The adjusted of pronoun 'she' has been translated as 'u' which is the same equivalent in ST. The near locative of 'here' again has been translated in TT as 'injâ' indicating the same effect and equivalent in ST. The back shifted of verb 'was' which was repeated two times is rendered as 'bud' i.e. (was) in ST. However Ghandhary has not back shifted the verbs 'was not', in the past tense and she rendered it as 'nist', i.e. (is not) indicating present time. Thus the duality of voices have been diminished to one voice, the character's voice. So, the effect of the FID has been changed to another type of discourse, the DD.

The next sample is the part of the Short story of Cortes Island (CRSID): The weather was clearing now and the days are getting longer. By the same token, the above sample is also a case of FID, because it has share in common with ID and DD features, the back shifted of tenses such as 'was clearing' and the near locative 'now' give rise to FID. However the translator could not show the multi voices. It means that she has not translated 'now' at all. By deleting the character' voice in FID sentences, only the narrator's voice could be heard thus the effect of the FID has been shifted to ID.

And finally the last sample is related to the My Mother's Dream (MMD): Being unable to carry a tune, he couldn't have a leading role but he was of course picked for the best background role, that of the king. According to the sentence, the back shifted of verb 'was picked' and the adjusted of pronoun 'he' and the modal of 'could not' as well as the exclamatory item 'of course' constitute FID. The word 'of course' as a character's voice, has not been translated. Moreover the third person pronoun 'he' has been translated to 'George'. Thus the duality of voices has been tended to one voice. It means that the FID has been changed to ID where only the narrator's voice could be heard. Moreover the modal auxiliary 'could' has been translated to 'tavânestan' i.e. (to be able) in ST.

Analyzing on the voices existed in the three selected short stories of The Love of a Good Woman written by Munro (1998) show the results that should be taken into account. According to Rachel (1994), translation changes the voices existed in the stories and in most of the time it is the translator voice that could be heard instead of the author's voice. On the basis of the findings obtained through data analysis, it is concluded that the variations occurred in the TTs are due to inconsistencies in reproducing the features of FID. It means that the translator Ghandhary has translated FID markers in a way that the effect of the FID is less emphasized. By considering on linguistic devices of FID markers, it is revealed that highest failures are taken place in rendering the indicators of FID on the lexical markers and then in the grammatical markers such as modalities, the adjusting of pronoun and the nearest locatives and temporals. There is no deviation on the punctuations markers.

On the modal auxiliaries of 'could' and 'would' it seems that translating of these types of modalities are the most problematic issues for translator when involving to them. According to Verdonk these modals function as the character's uncertainty in FID sentence. However in reproducing the modal auxiliary of 'could' although they are back shifted in TTs, they are rendered as 'tavânestan' in TTs, indicating 'to be able' in ST, therefore these deviations leads to reduce the effect of the FID. As Horri (2010) indicates this is due to lack of knowledge of one of the translators in rendering the indicators of language, especially on the grammatical markers, leads to change the effect of the FID.

Another, findings are founded in the nearest locatives and temporals. These indicators are expressed by the characters in DD. When they are mingled with some features of ID such as the past tense of verbs, then FID sentence is provided. In rendering the near temporal, for example the word 'now' as a character's voice is not rendered at all in CRSID. Since the near temporal 'now' in FID sentence indicates the character's voice, removing this item helps to ignore the character's voice and

therefore only the narrator's voice could be heard thus the duality of voices have been reduced to one voice. Moreover the effect of the FID has been transposed to ID. For this purpose Mason and Serban (2003) with respect of translating near deixis to distal deixis or ignoring them in the process of translation point out that the whole voice of character is being nebulous.

The same tokens are happened on exclamation item. They play a role as a character's voice in FID sentences. The word 'of course' as an exclamation item shows character's speech. It has not been translated at all. Moreover the third person pronoun 'he' has been translated to 'George'. These deviations direct the FID sentences to another type of discourse-ID. Thus the duality of voices have been decreased to one voice. These variations imply the failures in translating the third person into proper nouns. Rendering the pronouns used in FID with proper names lead to shift the voices from character's to narrator (Rouhianien, 2000). This deviation was happened in the first sample in which the third person pronoun 'she' has been translated as 'I'. This leads to corrupt the nature of FID and take it to DD. Thus the effect of the ambiguities existed between the voices have been lost. It means that the character's voice has been spoiled and only the narrator's voice could be heard.

Deviations in the TTs from the features of FID present in the ST not only impair the stylistic peculiarities of The Love of a Good Woman collection but also lead to lower the voices in the TTs compared with those heard in the STs. In fact, FID is used in the STs as stylistic techniques to create polyphony and any defect in fully presenting them in the TTs will result in diminishing the voices. In the translation of these short stories although, the translator seems to have been partially aware of the FID used in the STs and although, she has made an attempt to reproduce them in the TTs, the partial failure in reflecting the voices in the STs as well as in back-shifting the tenses have damaged the polyphonic nature of the STs.

CONCLUSION

To sum it up, the researcher draws the following conclusion: Deviations in the TTs from the features of FID present in the ST not only impair the stylistic peculiarities of The Love of a Good Woman collection, but also lead to lower the voices in the TTs compared with those heard in the STs. In fact, FID is used in the STs as stylistic techniques to create polyphony and any defect in fully presenting them in the TTs will result in

diminishing the voices. In the translation of these short stories although, the translator seems to have been partially aware of the FID used in the STs and although she has made an attempt to reproduce them in the TTs, the partial failure in reflecting the voices in the STs, as well as in back-shifting the tenses have damaged the polyphonic nature of the STs.

REFERENCES

Bakhtin, M., 1981. The Dialogic Imagination. In: Austin, TX, Holquist, M. (Ed.). University of Texas Press, ISBN 978-0-292-71742-8.

Bakhtin, M., 1984. Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics. Minnesota University Press, Minneapolis, Minnesota.

Baldick, C., 1990. The Concise Oxford Dictionary of Literary Terms. Oxford University Press, Oxford, England.

Hoff, M., 2009. Virginia Woolf's Mrs. Dalloway: Invisible Presences. University Digital Press, Clemson.

Horri, A., 2010. Translating personal deixis as point of view indexes in three Persian translations of woolf's to the lighthouse. Transl. Stud., 30: 5-20.

Mason, I. and A. Serban, 2003. Deixis as an interactive feature in literary translations from Romanian into English. Target, 15: 269-294.

McArthur, T., 1998. Concise Oxford Companion to the English Language. Oxford University Press. Oxford, England.

Munday, J., 2008. Style and Ideology in Translation: Latin American Writing in English. Routledge, New York, USA.

Munro, A., 1998. The Love of a Good Woman. McClelland and Stewart Inc. Toronto, Ontario, Canada.

Pascal, R., 1977. The Dual Voice: Free Indirect Speech and its Functioning in the Nineteen Century European Novel. Manchester University Press, Manchester, England.

Rachel, M., 1994. The Translator in the Text: On Reading Russian Literature in English. Northwestern University Press, Evanston, Illinois.

Rouhiainen, T., 2000. Free indirect discourse in the translation into Finnish: The case of DH Lawrence's Women in Love. Target, 12: 109-126.

Verdonk, P., 2002. Stylistics: Oxford Introduction to Language Study. Oxford University, Oxford, England.